

## INTRA-SYSTEM SHIFT FOUND IN BOROBUDUR TEMPLE TOURISM BROCHURE: A TRANSLATION STUDY

Valencia Friska Suarliem<sup>1\*</sup>, Ida Ayu Putu Chintya Maharani<sup>2</sup>, Ni Nyoman Tri Sukarsih<sup>3\*</sup>

*English Literature, Universitas Dhyana Pura, Badung, Indonesia*

---

### Article Info

#### Keywords:

*Intra-system shift;  
Tourism brochure  
Translation;*

---

### ABSTRACT

In translation, Intra-system shift is a translation process where a formally corresponding term in the source language (SL) loses its correspondence in the target language (TL). This study aims to analyze the intra-system shift from Indonesian as a source language into English as a target language of translation used in Borobudur Temple tourism brochure. It used a descriptive-qualitative method, which displayed the data with words in descriptive form. The data were taken from Borobudur Temple tourism brochure Indonesian-English translation. The data is then collected by using observation, documentation and note-taking methods. The data was analyzed by doing data reduction, data display, and drawing conclusion. The result shows that intra-system shift is indeed found in the Candi Borobudur Indonesian-English translation. From the five marks in intra-system shift, three marks were found in the brochure.

---

### Corresponding Author:

Ni Nyoman Tri Sukarsih  
Dhyana Pura University;  
[trisukarsih@undhirabali.ac.id](mailto:trisukarsih@undhirabali.ac.id)

*This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-SA license.*



---

## 1. INTRODUCTION (10 PT)

Catford (1965) stated that translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) with equivalent textual material in another language (TL). By "equivalent textual material," Catford means finding a corresponding word in the target language that retains the original meaning. Essentially, translation is the process of converting text from one language to another while preserving its meaning.

Catford (1965) also introduced the term "translation shift," which refers to the change of formal correspondence from the source language to the target language during the translation process. "Formal" in this context pertains to the similarity of linguistic forms. The concept of shift in translation arises from the translator's efforts to achieve equivalence between two language systems, bridging linguistic and cultural gaps to preserve meaning and message (Al-Zoubi & Al-Hassnawi, 2001; Agung & Suastini, 2022). Catford (1965: 73) further divides the concept of shift into two parts: level shift and category shift. Category shift occurs when a formally corresponding term in the source language changes to a different form in the target language. Intra-system shift is classified as a category shift.

Intra-system shift can be defined as a translation process where a term that formally corresponds in the source language loses its correspondence in the target language (Catford, 1965: 80). This shift is essential for producing a natural and accepted translation. Intra-system shifts occur internally within the language system and can be found in various written texts, including words, phrases, clauses, and sentences. According to Catford (1965), intra-system shifts can be identified by examining nouns or phrases that involve number or plurality and articles. For example, one language may use a singular form to indicate plurality or omit an article altogether. Plurality might be expressed through additional morphemes in some languages, like English, or through reduplication in others, such as Indonesian (Harbeck, 2013). Similarly, the use of an article is mandatory in some languages, such as English, but optional in others, such as Indonesian. Gender differences in language can also constitute intra-system shifts (Catford, 1965; Wangsawidjaja, 1995). For instance, the English phrase "many houses" translates to "banyak rumah" in Indonesian, using the singular form "rumah" instead of the plural "rumah-rumah," which is not acceptable in Indonesian or the English pronouns "she" and

"he" indicate gender, while the Indonesian equivalent "*dia*" is gender-neutral. Alzuhdy (2014) provided more structured markers for identifying intra-system shifts, including: a) noun as a general reference, b) plural noun after plural determiner, c) differences in the concept of plurality, and d) differences in expressing time and tenses. In essence, intra-systems shift could be identified by looking in the change form of the noun.

Brochures are a medium used to promote and sell tourist destinations through appealing images and persuasive language, providing information that attracts tourists and helps them plan their trips (Kelly, 1997; Valdeon, 2009). Borobudur Temple, a massive Buddhist monument in Indonesia, uses brochures to inform and advertise to both local and foreign tourists. These brochures, written in both Indonesian and English, contain information about maps, history, legend, and the architecture of Borobudur Temple.

Several studies have investigated translation shifts in written texts. Putri (2023) examined the Prambanan Temple brochure and identified seven instances of intra-system shifts in its translation. Fitria (2020) studied translation shifts in the movie "Guzaarish" and found 242 instances of level and category shifts, with 61 being intra-system shifts. Agung and Suastini (2022) conducted a study on the book "The Things You Can See Only When You Slow Down" and also identified intra-system shifts.

While numerous studies have examined translation shifts, there is a lack of research focusing specifically on intra-system shifts in Indonesian-English travel brochures. Therefore, this study aims to identify intra-system shifts in the Indonesian-English translation of the Borobudur Temple brochure.

## 2. METHODS (10 PT)

This study used descriptive-qualitative method. Descriptive-qualitative approach prioritized understanding the "what" and "how" of a phenomenon through detailed descriptions and thematic analysis of non-numerical data (Cresswell, 2018:17). Lambert (2012) emphasized that to present a thorough and nuanced picture of language events as they naturally occur, descriptive-qualitative research in linguistics emphasized the significance of context and the subjective experiences of language users. This study applied qualitative method to describe the data found in Borobudur Temple Indonesian-English translation.

The data source could be classified as secondary data. The data were taken from Borobudur Temple tourism brochure, Indonesian and English version. The brochure was retrieved through Borobudur Park's official website; <https://borobudurpark.com/brochure-page/>, accessed at May 30, 2024. The brochure is in a digital form, with the main data are words and phrases that contains intra-system shift found in the brochure.

This study employed non-participant observation with documentation and note-taking technique. Non-participant observation is a research method that involves observing participants without actively participating (William, 2008). The data was collected using purposive sampling technique to determine which sentence contained intra-system shift word or phrase. The steps of collecting data were as follows: first, visit the official Borobudur Park website and download the Indonesian and English version of Borobudur Temple brochures, second read and observing the brochures to identify the intra-system shift in a form of words and phrases, and last note-taking on every word and phrase containing intra-system shift found in the brochure.

The founded data was analyzed using Catford's theory by determining the marks of intra-system shift underwent in the words and phrases during the translation process. The data also analyzed by using Miles and Hubberman (1994; 2014) framework. The steps of analyzing data are as follow: first, reduce the data to determine which data were acceptable to be analyzed, second Identifying the appropriate marks of intra-system shifts for each data point., third displayed the data to show a more organized and structured using table, and last step was drawing conclusion to provide a detailed explanation of the words and phrases that underwent the intra-system shift process during translation.

## 3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### Result

This study is only focusing on intra-system shift unlike the previous study which discussed all types of translation shift. The result of this study is that the translation of Borobudur temple tourism from Indonesian language to English does contain an intra-system shift. From five indicators of intra-system shift, there are only three indicators of intra-system shift found in the brochures, six noun as general references; two plural noun after plural determiner; and one gender in the form of pronoun. There are 10 intra-system shifts found in four sentences collected from Borobudur Temple's brochure Indonesian-English translation, seven words and three phrases.

**Table 1.** Sentence Indicating Noun as General References

SL	TL
<b>Kegiatan</b> pembersihan dibarengi dengan upaya dokumentasi dan interpretasi <b>relief</b> .	<b>Activities</b> continued with documentation and interpretation of the <b>reliefs</b> .

Noun as general references is classified as intra-system shift, as shown in table 1, in the form of words. The first word containing shift is “kegiatan” in SL which translated into “activities” in TL and the second shift was the word “relief” in SL translated into phrase “the reliefs” in TL. The intra-system shift was found by looking at the differences of singular form in the SL and plural form in the TL. The differences occurred in the translation process from source language to target language for linguistic form fulfillment.

**Table 2.** Sentence Indicating Noun as General References

SL	TL
<b>Bagian</b> bukit yang berada dibawah candi juga mengalami erosi sehingga menjadikan <b>pondasi</b> candi tidak kuat, begitu pula dengan relief-relief di bagian bawah.	<b>The</b> hill below the temple was eroding, <b>the foundations</b> were being weakened and also the reliefs were being eroded.

In table 2, another noun as general references were found in the brochure in a form of words. In table 2, three intra-system shifts were found in the form of words. The first word is “Bagian” in SL translated into definite article “the” in TL, the second one is from “pondasi” in SL translated into “foundations” in TL. The last shift is the word “candi” in SL translated into definite article “the” in TL. The intra-system shifts in the second data shows that, beside the singular and plural differences of form, intra-system shifts also could be seen in the specifcness of the terms. SL could use nouns as whole, while TL has to be specific, i.e “bagian” (SL)- “the” (TL), and SL used nouns to shown the specifcness while TL use definite article to referred the same thing, i.e “candi” (SL) to “the” (TL).

**Table 3.** Sentence Indicating Plural Noun after Plural Determiners & Noun as General References

SL	TL
Philip berhasil menemukan <b>10 panel</b> yang tentang <b>kapal laut</b> ....	In total he found <b>10 panels</b> depicting <b>sea vessels</b> ....

Plural noun after plural determiners is also classified as intra-system shift. Moreover, noun as general references is also found in the form of phrases, as shown in table 3. The third data contained two phrases that were analyzed in this data. The phrases are “10 panel” and “kapal laut” in SL translated into “10 panels” and “sea vessels” in TL. Both of the phrases use singularity and plurality as the indicator. The first phrase used a plural determiner in the form of enumerator or number followed by a singular form<sup>21</sup> word in SL, but plural form of word in TL. SL grammatical rules did not allow plural determiners or numbers followed by plural, meanwhile TL grammatical rules obligated to use plural after plural determiners or numbers. The second phrase used singular in SL and plural in TL as general references.

**Table 4.** Sentence Indicating Noun Plural after Plural Determiners & Noun as General References

SL	TL
Pada <b>bagian</b> Rupadhatu terdapat <b>432 area</b> yang disebut Dyani Buddha.	In the <b>niches</b> of Rupadhatu there are <b>432 areas</b> called Dyani Buddha.

Another plural noun after plural determiner and noun as general references was founf in the form of word and phrase. The fourth data contained two phrases that were analyzed in this data. The word is “bagian” in SL translated into “niche” in TL. The word is used singular in SL and plural in TL as general references which also used to show specifcness whereas SL is not as specific as TL. The phrase is “432 area” in SL translated into “432 areas” in TL. The phrase used a plural determiner in the form of enumerator or number followed by a singular form word in SL, but plural form of word in TL. SL grammatical rules did not allow plural determiners or numbers followed by plural, meanwhile TL grammatical rules obligated to use plural after plural determiners or numbers.

**Table 5.** Sentence Indicating Gender Pronoun

SL	TL
Di sanalah <b>dia</b> mendapatkan pencerahan dan menjadi Bodhi.	.... There <b>he</b> gained extensive knowledge is Bodhi.

The intra-system shift that was found was a gender pronoun in a form of word, based on table 5. The third-person pronoun “dia” in SL was translated into “he” in TL. SL doesn’t have gender or neutral in the system, while TL has. The term in SL is equivalent in TL but intra-system shift has to occur due to the differences of gender’s system in both languages.

### Discussion

The Borobudur temple brochure Indonesian-English translation was analyzed to find the intra-system shift. The information within the brochures was reduced to find which sentences consisted of intra-system shift in form of word and phrases. From the process, it was found that in Borobudur temple brochure Indonesian-English translation indeed consists of an intra-system shift. Four sentences were found which have a total of 10 intra-system shift, seven words and three phrases. From five indicators of intra-system shift, there are only three indicators of intra-system shift found in the brochures, six noun as general references; two plural nouns after plural determiner; and one gender in the form of pronoun.

**Table 1**

In table 1, the first intra-system shift can be found in the word "kegiatan" in the source language (SL), which is translated as "activities" in the target language (TL). This shift involves changing the singular form in the SL to a plural form in the TL. According to the SL, the activities already completed were "kegiatan pembersihan," meaning “cleaning activities.” This data refers to a previous section that detailed the various cleaning tasks performed by the laborers, indicating that it was not just one activity. Therefore, the word "kegiatan" demonstrates that in the SL, a singular noun can refer to general activities, whereas in the TL, this is not possible due to stricter grammatical rules. This shows that the equivalent meaning of a singular word in Indonesian is often plural in English. Consequently, translating the singular "kegiatan" from the SL to the plural "activities" in the TL is more acceptable than keeping it singular.

The second intra-system shift in the first sentence involves the word “relief” in the SL, translated to the phrase "the reliefs" in the TL. The first thing to be discussed is the involvement of the additional definite article "the" in the TL. The SL does not use any articles, whereas the TL requires an article due to grammatical rules that necessitate articles when referring to something specific, which indicates reliefs of the Borobudur temple and not reliefs in general. In the SL, the word "tersebut" can be used to achieve the same specificity, but it might sound awkward or just the style of the writer. Thus, the definite article "the" was added in the TL to clarify certain reliefs. Another thing to be discussed is the singular form in the SL changes to a plural form in the TL. It is well-known that a temple has multiple reliefs; every wall in a temple is adorned with reliefs. For this reason, the TL uses the plural form to describe all the reliefs found in the temple, whereas the SL can refer to all the reliefs in general with just the singular form. This illustrates that the equivalent meaning of a singular form in the SL can be a plural form in the TL. The shift from singular to plural form ensures acceptability to the target reader and adherence to their grammatical rules. Therefore, the singular word "relief" in the SL is translated to the plural "reliefs" in the TL.

**Table 2**

The first intra-system shifts in table 2 is found in the translation of the word "bagian" from the source language (SL) to the definite article "the" in the target language (TL). Literally, "bagian" means "part," but in this context, the TL translates "bagian" to "the" to refer to the specific noun it modifies, which is the hill that is located bright under the temple. The use of the definite article "the" in the TL avoids repetition, making the sentence more fluid and natural. This demonstrates a common translation strategy where specific grammatical elements in the SL are adapted to fit the grammatical conventions of the TL, enhancing readability and communication.

The second intra-system shift involves the word "pondasi" in the SL, which is translated to "foundations" in the TL. The singular form in the SL changes to a plural form in the TL. Temples, especially Borobudur temple, have a stacked shape and certainly all stacks have their own foundations. For this reason, the TL uses the plural form to refer to all the foundations of the temple's stacks, whereas the SL can refer to all the foundations in general with just the singular form. This illustrates that the equivalent meaning of a singular

form in the SL can be a plural form in the TL. The shift from singular to plural form ensures acceptability to the target reader and adherence to their grammatical rules. Therefore, the singular word "pondasi" in the SL is translated to the plural "foundations" in the TL.

The third intra-system shift involves the addition of the definite article "the" in the target language (TL). The source language (SL) does not use any articles, whereas the TL requires an article due to grammatical rules that necessitate articles when referring to specific items, which is the foundations of the Borobudur temple, rather than foundations in general. In the SL, an additional word, "candi" (temple), must be included to clarify which foundations are being referred to in the text. Therefore, while the SL uses an additional word to specify certain foundations, the TL adds the definite article "the" to achieve the same clarity. This shift ensures that the translation is precise and adheres to the grammatical conventions of the TL.

### Table 3

The first shift involves the phrase "10 panel" in the source language (SL), which was translated to "10 panels" in the target language (TL). In the SL, "panel" is singular, even though "10" indicates plurality. However, the rule in the TL is different. In the TL, the number "10" indicates plurality, and the noun that follows, "panels," must also be in the plural form. If the translation followed the singular form like in the SL, it would be "10 panel," which is incorrect and does not conform to the TL's grammatical rules. This shift ensures that the translation is grammatically acceptable in the TL.

The second intra-system shift involves the phrase "kapal laut" in the SL, which is translated to "sea vessels" in the TL. The singular form in the SL changes to a plural form in the TL. This sentence indicates that more than one panel illustrates sea vessels. For this reason, the TL uses the plural form to refer to all the panels containing sea vessels, whereas the SL can refer to all the panels in general with just the singular form. This illustrates that the equivalent meaning of a singular form in the SL can be a plural form in the TL. The shift from singular to plural form ensures acceptability to the target reader and adherence to their grammatical rules.

### Table 4

The word "bagian" in the SL was translated to "niches" in the TL, as shown in table 4. The word "bagian" literally means "part." In the SL, "bagian" was chosen to describe a specific part of Rupadhatu. However, in the TL, the translation specifies "niches," which more accurately describes the parts being referred to. "Niches" literally means "relung" in Indonesian. This specific word was chosen to give a clearer explanation to the target reader about the parts being described. Additionally, the translation in the TL uses the plural form instead of the singular form used in the SL. This is because the niches in Borobudur temple are numerous, not singular. Therefore, the TL uses the plural form to describe all the niches, whereas the SL can refer to all the niches in general with just the singular form. This shift from singular to plural ensures that the translation is acceptable to the target reader and adheres to their grammatical rules.

The second shift involves the phrase "432 area" in the SL, which was translated to "432 areas" in the TL. In the SL, "area" is singular, even though "432" already indicates plurality. However, the rule in the TL is different. In the TL, the number "432" indicates plurality, and the noun that follows, "areas," must also be in the plural form. If the translation followed the singular form like in the SL, it would be "432 area," which is incorrect and does not conform to the TL's grammatical rules. This shift ensures that the translation is grammatically acceptable in the TL.

### Table 5

In Table 5, the first intra-system shift identified is the pronoun "dia" in the source language (SL) translated into "he" in the target language (TL). The SL has a formal correspondence in TL. The brochure's context tells the story of Prince Sidharta, meaning the pronoun refers to him. In SL, the pronoun "dia" is neutral and does not specify gender. However, in TL, pronouns indicate gender. Therefore, "dia" must be translated as either "he" or "she" in TL. Using a neutral pronoun like "it" would be inappropriate, as "it" is typically used for animals or objects, not people. Since the sentence clearly refers to Prince Sidharta, the pronoun "he" was chosen.

## 4. CONCLUSION

The study that has been conducted showed that intra-system shift appeared within tourism brochures, specifically in translation of Borobudur Temple from Indonesian language to English. To analyze intra-system shift, five indicators were used. The study showed that four sentences within the translation of Borobudur Temple from Indonesian language to English consisted of intra-system shift, with seven words and three phrases. From five indicators, only three indicators were found in translation of Borobudur Temple from

Indonesian language to English. The shifts found are six nouns as general references, two noun plural after plural determiner, and one gender in the form of pronoun.

Nouns used as general references found are in the first table: 1) the word “kegiatan” in SL, which translated as “activities” in TL, 2) the word “relief” in SL, which translated as “the reliefs” in TL. In second table, the intra-system shift found are 3) the word “bagian” in SL translated to “the” in TL, 4) the word “pondasi” in SL translated to “the” in TL, and 5) the word “candi” in SL translated to definite article “the” in TL. In the third table, the noun as general references were found in phrase 6) “kapal laut” in SL became “sea vessels”. In the fourth sentence, the intra-system shift found is 7) The word “bagian” in SL translated to “niches” in TL. Noun plural after noun determiner was found in the third table; 1) “10 panel” in the SL translated to “10 panels” in TL. In the fourth data, 2) “432 area” in SL translated to “432 areas” in TL. The last indicator was gender with only one sentence as could be seen in table 5, the word “dia” in SL was translated into “he” in TL. In particular, this study revealed that nouns in the TL (English) require to be in plural form for it to be grammatically correct, whereas in SL (Indonesian) nouns can be singular even when they refer to multiple items.

## REFERENCES

- Al-Zoubi, M. Q. R., & Hassnawi, A. S. (2001). Constructing translation theories: A sociolinguistic perspective. *Journal of Translation*, 7(1), 35-47. <https://doi.org/10.24071/joll.v18i2.1598>
- Catford, J. C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory of Translation: An Essay in Applied Linguistics*. London: Oxford University Press (Internet Archive) (SCIRP).
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.
- Fitria, T. N. (2020). Translation Shift in English into Indonesian Subtitle of Guzaarish Movie. *Journal of Language and Literature*, 20(2), 307. <https://doi.org/10.24071/joll.v20i2.2601>
- Harbeck. (2013, February 27). *9 confusing ways to pluralize words*. Theweek. <https://theweek.com/articles/467305/9-confusing-ways-pluralize-words>
- Kelly, P. (1997). Effective travel marketing: The role of brochures. *Tourism Management*, 18(5), 331-338.
- Lambert, V. A., & Lambert, C. E. (2012). Qualitative descriptive research: An acceptable design. *Pacific Rim International Journal of Nursing Research*, 16(4), 255-256. Retrieved from <https://he02.tci-thaijo.org/index.php/PRIJNR/article/view/5805>
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook*. sage.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *A methods sourcebook*. In *Qualitative data analysis*. Sage Thousand Oaks.
- Putri, P. D. K. (2023). INTRA-SYSTEM SHIFT ANALYSIS IN THE TRANSLATION OF TOURISM BROCHURE. In *Seminar Ilmiah Nasional Teknologi, Sains, dan Sosial Humaniora (SINTESA)* (6). Retrieved from <https://jurnal.undhirabali.ac.id/index.php/sintesa/article/view/2795>
- Valdeon, R. A. (2009). The use of persuasive language in travel brochures: Implications for translation. *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change*, 7(4), 343-356.
- Williams, J. P. (2008). *Non-participant observation*. In L. M. Given (Ed.), *The Sage encyclopedia of qualitative research methods*. Los Angeles: Sage Publications.
- Wangsawidjaja, D. (1995). *A Linguistic Analysis On Shifts In The Translation Of The Speckled Band Into Bahasa Indonesia*. [Undergraduate Thesis]. Universitas Airlangga.